

NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE  
**RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**Non-Government (Voting)**

Timothy E. Johns (Chair)  
*State of Hawai'i*

Linda Paul (Vice Chair)  
*Conservation*

Kem Lowry (Secretary)  
*Citizen-at-Large*

Solomon Kaho'ohalahala  
*Native Hawaiian Elder*

Pelika Andrade  
*Native Hawaiian*

Rick Gaffney  
*Recreational Fishing*

Bill Gilmartin  
*Research*

Geoffrey Walker  
*Commercial Fishing*

Gail Grabowsky  
*Education*

Tammy Harp  
*Native Hawaiian*

Cindy Hunter  
*Research*

Richard Lee  
*Ocean-Related Tourism*

Don Schug  
*Research*

Vacant  
*Conservation*

Jessica Wooley  
*Conservation*

**Government (Non-Voting)**

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Allen Tom  
*HIHW National Marine Sanctuary*

David W. Laist  
*Marine Mammal Commission*

Michael Lesser  
*National Science Foundation*

Eric Roberts  
*U.S. Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*U.S. Department of Defense*

Kitty Simonds  
*WESPAC*

Matt Brown  
*U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service*

Hoku Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

*Meeting July 13, 2017*

*9:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m.*

*Mokupāpapa Discovery Center*

*76 Kamehameha Avenue*

*Hilo, Hawai'i 96720*

**Meeting Minutes**

**ATTENDEES:**

Voting Members Present: Gail Grabowsky (Education); Cindy Hunter (Research); Tim Johns (State of Hawai'i, Chair); Linda Paul (Conservation, Vice-Chair); Don Schug (Research); Jessica Wooley (Conservation); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing); Kem Lowry (Citizen-at-Large, Secretary); Carol Wilcox (Conservation Alternate for Vacant Seat); Tammy Harp (Native Hawaiian); Bill Gilmartin (Research); Solomon Kaho'ohalahala (Native Hawaiian Elder); Geoffrey Walker (Commercial Fishing)

Voting Members Absent: Pelika Andrade (Native Hawaiian); Richard Lee (Ocean-Related Tourism).

Non-Voting Members Present: Eric Roberts (U.S. Coast Guard [USCG]) by phone; Josh DeMello (Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council [Wespac]); Athline Clark (Office of National Marine Sanctuaries [ONMS]/Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument [PMNM]); Hoku Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima (National Marine Fisheries Service [NMFS]); Matt Brown (U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service [FWS] National Wildlife Refuge System, Pacific Marine National Monuments); Janice Fukawa (Department of Defense).

Non-Voting Members Absent: Michael Lesser (National Science Foundation); Allen Tom (Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary [HIHWNMS]); David Laist (Marine Mammal Commission).

Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument Staff: Cynthia Vanderlip (State of Hawai'i, Department of Land and Natural Resources [DLNR]); David Swatland, Alyssa Miller, Nicole Evans, Virginia Branco, Clayton Watkins, Gina McGuire, Tim Brown, Kaliko High (ONMS-PMNM).

Members of the Public, Other Agency Members, and Presenters: Shad Kane (Native Hawaiian Elder Alternate) by phone; Rick Hoo (Recreational Fishing Alternate); Christine Reed (Downtown Improvement Association); Owen Koehnen; Bevin Kilfoyle; Katelin Branco; Gary Beals; Kealoha Pisciotta (Cultural Working Group).

**I. OPENING PROTOCOL (PMNM STAFF)**

PMNM staff member Moani Pai gives a description and explains the significance of the PMNM meleles *Puka Mai ka Lā* and *Mele No Papahānaumokuākea*.

## II. ROLL CALL; REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA (JOHNS)

Chair Tim Johns called the meeting to order. There were no changes to the published agenda.

Chair Johns announced that he will be stepping down as a member of the RAC. Governor Ige will be appointing a new State of Hawai‘i Representative. Discussion to follow regarding council elections.

Introductions followed. New RAC members Solomon Kaho‘ohalahala (Native Hawaiian Elder) and Geoffrey Walker (Commercial Fishing) were introduced.

## III. REVIEW OF AGENDA AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES (JOHNS)

The council approved the meeting minutes from the May 4, 2017 meeting and the June 27, 2017 teleconference.

## IV. BRIEF REVIEW & SUMMARY PREVIOUS ISSUES, ACTION ITEMS AND STATUS

1. New Member Selection Subcommittee (Evans): PMNM Staff member Nicole Evans explained the new member selection subcommittee responsibilities and feedback matrix. Subcommittee members are asked to score each applicant by how well they meet each of the selection criteria. Scores are added-up and a total score for each applicant is tallied.

The scores will be used to rank the applicants for each council seat. The three highest ranked applicants for each seat will be forwarded to the PMNM superintendent for consideration. If there are fewer than three applicants for a seat, all names will be forwarded. Based on the subcommittee’s input, the monument superintendent will then provide her recommendations to the Pacific Island Regional Director who will finally submit his recommendations to the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (ONMS) Director.

2. Climate Change Impacts on Coral Species in NWHI (Clark): The RAC was provided a report written by coral scientist Dr John Burns addressing the climate change impacts on specific coral species in the NWHI. This report is available on the PMNM website.

3. Finalized Charter (Swatland): The new charter was approved by ONMS Headquarters. Thank you to all the work the charter subcommittee did in writing the new charter. Discussion relating to further actions related to the new charter are later in the meeting (Section VIII).

4. Testimony on Executive Order on the Review of Designation Under the Antiquities Act (Clark/Johns): The RAC held two teleconferences (June 27 and July 10, 2017) to finalize testimony on Executive Order on the Review of Designation Under the Antiquities Act. The testimony was submitted on July 10, 2017 via mail. The letter expressed opposition to any changes to the Monument by the current administration. It is available on the RAC website.

RAC leadership expressed concern regarding the emergency meeting and leadership making decisions on behalf of the Council. For EO 13795 (comments due July 26) it is recommended

that the RAC make a motion on the substance of the letter later in the meeting. Any technical changes needed can be made at the discretion of leadership.

Details and further discussion appear later in the meeting (Section VIII).

5. HICEAS Follow-up Questions (Swatland): NMFS staff members addressed questions the RAC posed at the May 4 meeting. A copy of these answers were provided to the councilmembers and is available on the RAC website.

6. In Progress Action Items on Visitor Centers (Swatland): The requested information regarding sanctuary visitor centers was presented by Mr. Swatland. Out of 14 NMS sites, nine have visitor centers. Each differs as to its primary purpose/functions, funding mechanisms and other aspects. Details are available in a summary document being circulated.

**ONMS Action:** Provide RAC the MDC recommended donation sheet with rental fee information

USFWS has completed traffic studies on Oahu at James Campbell Wildlife Refuge regarding turning some recently donated land into an administration and visitor center. This year, a rough schematic design will be done for the visitor center. The visitor center will feature all four of the Pacific Marine National Monuments. USFWS is interested in putting a visitor center on Nudist Colony Road, Kahuku.

**USFWS Action:** Provide RAC schematic design of potential James Campbell Visitors Center when prepared

RAC member suggests because of the exposure, the potential visitor center should be located in Waikiki.

For further discussion, it is advised the Visitor Center subcommittee meet and present to the Council at a future time.

7. In Progress Action Items Sanctuary Designation and the Monument Management Plan (Clark): Designation and management plan are on hold until the recommendations from the Executive Orders 13792 and 13795 are complete. Recommendations are expected to be released in late October 2017. Internal analysis and planning is continuing so that ONMS will be prepared when final recommendations are given.

8. In Progress Action Item Regarding Wespac (DeMello): Council decisions on fishing regulation options and recommendations to NMFS are also on hold until the recommendations for the executive orders are released. Wespac is anticipating addressing the regulations at the March 2018 meeting.

#### V. MONUMENT CO-TRUSTEE/MANAGEMENT AGENCY UPDATE/HIGHLIGHTS

1. NOAA-ONMS report (Clark): Highlights include: PMNM participates in various activities in support of the 75<sup>th</sup> anniversary commemoration of the Battle of Midway, World Oceans Day

and Year of the Hawaiian Monk Seal Celebration, PMNM Native Hawaiian youth urge UN leaders to save the ocean: #MyOceanPledge, and the dive team mission embarks to explore the sunken heritage of Midway Atoll May 2017. The PowerPoint version of the ONMS presentation, and the full written report, are available on the PMNM website.

RAC members inquired about the status of the NOAA BWET funds. ONMS response: funds are secure this year, uncertain for next year.

2. NOAA-NMFS report (Ka‘aekuahiwi-Pousima): Malia Chow is the new Habitat Conservation Division branch chief overseeing monuments and essential fish habitat. NMFS staff has been busy responding to Executive Order 13795 comments.

3. State of Hawaii report (Vanderlip): Ms. Vanderlip presented to the Council an update on Kure Atoll. Highlights include strategy for managing invasive species; habitat restoration; eradication of mosquito, bigheaded ant, and rat; and the marine debris action plan. The presentation is available on the RAC website.

4. FWS Pacific Islands Region (Brown): Highlights include: Battle of Midway 75th Anniversary Commemoration reached over 4 million people, *Midway: Edge of Tomorrow* is ready for screening. The film depicts Midway Atoll National Wildlife Refuge as a complex paradise: blue lagoons and unique, vibrant coral ecosystems, culturally sacred sites, millions of birds, and a rich history of the Pacific Ocean theater of World War II. The mouse eradication project is on track, with an EA in progress. Target for project initiation is summer of 2018.

FWS is collaborating with the US Navy and the US Army, Corps of Engineers on seawall project in Bulky Dump area. FWS is continuing with the 3rd year of lead-based paint remediation on Sand Island. There is also a water tower removal project. The disintegrating old water tower is also a seabird entanglement hazard.

FWS and NMFS visit to Tern Island, French Frigate Shoals in April found increasing shoreline erosion, failing seawalls and exposed dump-sites. The team also observed erosion at Lisianski Island. FWS can provide more information on infrastructure at Tern Island and how issues (including SLR and other climate change effects) are being addressed. The tide station at Tern Island is still functional.

5. OHA report: No report.

6. Update on enforcement activities (Roberts): No reports on violations.

#### VI. TOUR OF MOKUPĀPAPA DISCOVERY CENTER

Councilmembers received a tour of part of the Discovery Center. MDC Staff Kaliko High, Virginia Branco, and Tim Brown led the tour.

#### VII. *MIDWAY: EDGE OF TOMORROW* MOVIE SHOWING

RAC members viewed a film produced by Tandem, Stills, and Motion for the Midway 75 celebration. USFWS is looking at possible commercial distribution.

## VIII. BRIEFINGS AND POTENTIAL ACTIONS

### 1. Actions associated with revised Charter (Clark, Johns)

The Charter states:

4. The non-governmental members and alternates, with the exception of the State of Hawai‘i representative, are appointed for a term of three years, and may compete for reappointment (subject to the non-governmental term limits policy described at Members, Alternates, and Officers, 9. below). If necessary, subsequent terms of appointment may be changed to provide for balanced (staggered) expiration dates.

9. Non-governmental seat term limits policy: Non-governmental council members will not be selected to serve more than three consecutive terms on the council. This policy applies to the seat (e.g., Ocean-related tourism industry seat). If qualified, the same individual may apply for another seat on the council (e.g., Citizen-at-large) once he/she is term-limited on another seat (e.g., Ocean-related tourism industry). The director may waive the limit if a particular seat is difficult to fill or continuity of membership is deemed critical.

In order to have a smooth transition under the new term limits, ONMS proposes a phased approach to renew a portion of the seats at a time, beginning with those who have served the longest, until the rotation schedule specified in the Charter is met. Members will have the opportunity to reapply for their current seat for one more term.

**ONMS Action:** When the new State of Hawai‘i Representative is confirmed, ONMS will inform the RAC.

Currently there are eight councilmembers who have served sixteen years, beyond the maximum stated in the Charter. Prior to the October 12 RAC meeting, the New Member Subcommittee will review the eight seats. The subcommittee will provide feedback to the Superintendent regarding four seats to advertise in 2017 and four seats to advertise in 2018.

With the departure of Chair Johns, council officer elections are tentatively scheduled to be held at the October 12 meeting.

As stated in the Charter:

Terms of the chair and vice chair are two years, except that the term of the vice chair is one year if, for some reason, the chair and vice chair positions are filled at the same time. The chair and vice chair may serve a maximum of two consecutive terms (i.e., four years total), if reelected. A chair or vice chair may leave his/her term to run for another council officer position, if desired. If the chair or vice chair is elected to a new position, the council shall nominate and elect a new representative for the vacated position. Only voting members may nominate and serve as council officers. The term of the council secretary is one year. The council secretary may serve consecutive terms, if reelected.

If elections are to be held, voting councilmembers will be contacted prior to the October 12 meeting for officer nominations. Members are also able to self-nominate. Those members nominated will be informed before the meeting. Selection of candidates for council officer

positions is by majority vote of all council members, including the non-voting members and votes shall be made by written ballot. Members who will not be present at the time of an election may submit their votes in writing to the site superintendent prior to a meeting. New Council officers will be announced at the October 12 meeting.

If a newly elected RAC officer is one of the four seats up for recruitment in 2017, they move to 2018 recruitment.

#### IX. PRESENTATIONS AND UPDATES

##### 1. Mokupāpapa Discovery Center Staff Presentation

MDC staff Virginia Branco, Clayton Watkins, Gina McGuire, Tim Brown, and Kaliko High addressed the Council to discuss the daily operations of MDC, educational uses of the facility, and community partners.

##### 2. Mokupāpapa Discovery Center Partners Presentation

a. Owen Koehnen gave a presentation on the history of the Koehnen building and the Hilo downtown community. Mr. Koehnen told of the improvements of the waterfront park across the street of MDC.

b. Katelin Branco has been involved with MDC since her childhood. Her artwork inspired by PMNM was recently featured at *A Culture Lab on Convergence* with The Smithsonian Asian Pacific American Center. The artwork is now on display at MDC. Katelin also volunteers her time at MDC.

c. Gina McGuire (ONMS staff) grew-up on the Big Island and is extremely proud that Hilo is able to host MDC and be a resource to the people of Hawaii.

d. Bevin Kilfoyle is a mother of two who uses the MDC facility and resources with her children often. She expressed her gratitude to MDC and staff for their ocean stewardship education resources.

e. Christine Reed (Downtown Improvement Association) is involved with community outreach programs at MDC. She expressed the importance of MDC as a gathering space for the Hilo community.

#### VIII. BRIEFINGS AND POTENTIAL ACTIONS (CONTINUED)

##### 2. NOAA public comment period on Sec. 4(b) in Executive Order 13795 Presidential Executive Order Implementing an America-First Offshore Energy Strategy (Council)

Council to submit letter addressing Executive Order 13795. Per John Armor's letter, RAC to address two questions: (1) Does protection preclude mineral/energy development in the long run? (2) If so, what are the benefits and costs?

Councilmember Wilcox will compile approved content. The Council will develop response letter, using Councilmember Schug's research/brief as starting point. RAC Executive Committee to review and approve final content.

**RAC Action Item:** RAC votes unanimously to add following content: address future long-term value/potential for regeneration and 'use' and intergenerational values; note that oil/gas

resources absent; no proximal energy market; adequacy of Federal, State and OHA consultations prior to designation and expansion.

The signed, final version to be sent to all RAC members and ONMS Director John Armor.

### 3. Upcoming Joint RAC/SAC meeting

ONMS Director John Armor will be on Oahu the week of December 4, 2017 and has requested a joint RAC/SAC meeting at the IRC. This meeting will be in addition to the scheduled October 12 meeting. More information will be given to the RAC as it becomes available.

### X. PUBLIC COMMENT

Comments by Kealoha Pisciotta: Native Hawaiian values and approaches to resource management need to be considered in the EO reviews. For Native Hawaiians, resources are not just material things, in our world view they are kumu, sources, essential basis of our genealogy. Support systems, human spiritual and cultural needs should be put first, before economic 'use' values. Alternative valuation systems such as those addressed by Kirstin Oleson (University of Hawai'i) should be referenced. Native Hawaiian consultation on mineral extraction is required under Federal law.

### XI. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 3:45 p.m.