

NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE  
**RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**Non-Government (Voting)**

William Aila, Jr (Chair)  
*State of Hawai'i*

Linda Paul (Vice Chair)  
*Conservation*

Rick Gaffney (Secretary)  
*Recreational Fishing*

Pelika Andrade  
*Native Hawaiian*

Gail Grabowsky  
*Education*

Tammy Harp  
*Native Hawaiian*

Cindy Hunter  
*Research*

Solomon Kaho'ohalahala  
*Native Hawaiian Elder*

Jean Kenyon (Acting Primary)  
*Research*

Richard Lee  
*Ocean-Related Tourism*

Don Schug  
*Research*

Geoffrey Walker  
*Commercial Fishing*

Carol Wilcox  
*Conservation*

Jessica Wooley  
*Conservation*

Vacant  
*Citizen-at-Large*

**Government (Non-Voting)**

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Sara Thompson  
*HIHW National Marine Sanctuary*

Vacant  
*Marine Mammal Commission*

Vacant  
*National Science Foundation*

Eric Roberts  
*U.S. Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*U.S. Department of Defense*

Kitty Simonds  
*WESPAC*

Matt Brown  
*U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service*

Hoku Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

*Meeting July 19, 2018*

*9:00 a.m. – 3:30 p.m.*

*Marine Education & Training Center  
10 Sand Island Parkway Honolulu, HI 96819*

**Meeting Minutes**

**ATTENDEES:**

RAC Voting Members Present: William Aila Jr. (State of Hawai'i, Chair); Linda Paul (Conservation, Vice-Chair); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing, Secretary); Tammy Harp (Native Hawaiian); Jean Kenyon (Research, acting Primary); Solomon Kaho'ohalahala (Native Hawaiian Elder); Don Schug (Research,); Gail Grabowsky (Education); Richard Lee (Ocean-Related Tourism); Jessica Wooley (Conservation, by phone) and Carol Wilcox (Conservation, by phone).

RAC Voting Members Absent: Cindy Hunter (Research); Pelika Andrade (Native Hawaiian) and Geoff Walker (Commercial Fishing).

RAC Non-Voting Members Present: Shad Kane (Native Hawaiian Elder Alternate); Athline Clark (Office of National Marine Sanctuaries [ONMS] / Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument [PMNM]); Sara Thompson (ONMS/Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary [HIHWNMS]); Hoku Johnson (National Marine Fisheries Service [NMFS]); Dan Polhemus (U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service [FWS] Ecological Service) and Eric Roberts (U.S. Coast Guard [USCG]).

RAC Non-Voting Members Absent: Josh DeMello (Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council [WPFMC]) and Janice Fukawa (Depart of Defense, US Navy).

ONMS Staff: Pua Borges, Naomi McIntosh, Nicole Evans, Alyssa Miller, Jon Martinez, and Justin Rivera.

Other Agency Staff: Keola Lindsey (Office of Hawaiian Affairs [OHA]); Maria Carnevale (State of Hawai'i, Department of Land and Natural Resources [DLNR] Division of Aquatic Resources [DAR]); Andy Haskins-Sullivan (State of Hawai'i, DLNR Division of Forestry and Wildlife [DOFAW] Bradon Jim On (NOAA Office of Law Enforcement [OLE]) and Tiare Holm (National Marine Sanctuary Foundation [NMSF]).

Members of the Public: Alohi Nakachi, Leslie Acton (Colorado State University/University of Hawai'i)

**I. CALL TO ORDER (Aila Jr.)**

Chair William Aila Jr. called the meeting to order. Introductions followed.

## II. REVIEW OF AGENDA AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Aila Jr.)

There were no changes to the published agenda. The council approved the meeting minutes from the March 15, 2018 meeting.

## III. BRIEF REVIEW & SUMMARY PREVIOUS ISSUES, ACTION ITEMS AND STATUS

1. RAC Action: Public Comment Submission *Midway Seabird Protection Plan Draft Environmental Assessment*. The Council submitted a letter written regarding the DEIS on April 19, 2018.
2. New member recruitment (in progress): The Member Selection subcommittee has submitted feedback to PMNM-ONMS on Citizen-at-Large Primary and Alternate, Research Primary, and Conservation Alternate seats. PMNM-ONMS will submit candidates to ONMS HQ for approval.
3. RAC/SAC Action: Letter to ONMS Director John Armor regarding Executive Orders 13792 and 13795 (Aila Jr.): No change in status. No recommendations on the Executive Orders have been made public. Chair Aila Jr. recommends not moving forward at this time.
4. ONMS Action: Sanctuary designation and monument management plan (Clark): No update. ONMS is not moving forward with the public process until the final recommendations of Executive Orders 13792 and 13795 are released.
5. State of Hawai'i action: Keep RAC informed on 30x30 Initiative throughout election year. Inform RAC if there is an opportunity for public input or comment. No change in status.

## IV. MONUMENT CO-TRUSTEE/MANAGEMENT AGENCY UPDATE/HIGHLIGHTS

1. NOAA-NMFS report (Johnson): Ms. Johnson, Technical Services Program Lead for Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center, presented a PowerPoint of a 2018 Mid-Season Snapshot. Highlights included: a protected species overview and marine debris clean-up efforts. The presentation is available on the PMNM/RAC website.

**NMFS Action:** The Council requested a presentation from NOAA-NMFS on the effects of the volcano eruption on turtles.

2. NOAA-ONMS report (Clark): Ms. Clark presented a PowerPoint of ONMS highlights from the past few months. Features included: NOAA and National Park Service collaboration to inform public about Kīlauea eruption, World Oceans Day festivities and the premiere of *ōlelo Hawai'i Moana*, "Voices of Papahānaumokuākea": PMNM Hawaiian Oral Histories Project, and PMNM scientists supporting the QUEST Undergraduate Coral Reef Survey Course. The PowerPoint version of the ONMS presentation and the full written report are available on the PMNM/RAC website.

The Council requested more information on public announcement by Senator Schatz of up to \$1,000,000 in new funding for PMNM announced in March 2018. The funding is subject to a 100 percent non-federal match. Clark responded that this was not the first year of this funding

and that \$500,000 had been appropriated in fiscal year 2017 and 2018. In the first year of the grant, funds were for National Fish and Wildlife Foundation (NFWF) to spend on research purposes, in the second year they were also awarded to NFWF but the final outcome of the project funding has not yet been determined.

The NFWF staff asked the Papahānaumokuākea Monument Management Board for a set of funding priorities. The grant cannot be used for Monument operations. Funding is coming from the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries allocation. In fiscal year 2019, the Senate appropriations mark up asked for up to \$1,000,000 in match, which was what we think is the announcement by Senator Schatz was referring to. The pending appropriations language for fiscal year 2019 for the House of Representatives is another \$500,000 and the Senate is \$1,000,000.

**ONMS Action:** Keep RAC informed on list of funding activities and benefits. The RAC also requests to stay informed on the effects to the operating budget.

3. State of Hawai'i DAR report (Carnevale): Ms. Carnevale provided a written report to the RAC on updates from the State of Hawai'i DLNR-DAR. The State of Hawai'i DLNR-DAR report is available on the PMNM/RAC website.

4. State of Hawai'i DOFAW report (Haskins-Sullivan): Mr. Haskins-Sullivan provided a written report to the RAC on updates from the State of Hawai'i DLNR-DOFAW highlighting Kure Atoll. The State of Hawai'i DLNR-DOFAW report is available on the PMNM/RAC website.

5. FWS Ecological Services report (Polhemus): Mr. Polhemus provided a summary on climate indicators from the PMNM Climate Change Working Group. Early 2018 shows a slight abatement from record heating trends and for 2018, the Arctic maximum sea ice extent was the second-lowest in the satellite record. The presentation is available on the PMNM/RAC website.

6. OHA report (Lindsey): Mr. Lindsey provided program updates from OHA to the Council. An OHA group is presently on Midway Atoll, including a *makaloa* (*Cyperus laevigatus*) expert. The group is working on habitat restoration, assisting with other projects, and getting perspective on management issues such as mouse control. In September, a multi-disciplinary trip to Nihoa on *Makani Olu* will combine monk seal research, FWS botanical surveys, and an archaeological survey. The group will assess resources of base camp including condition of physical cultural resources and implications r.e. *pōpolo* (*Solanum nelsonii*). Recent OHA capacity building actions include launching a process to build a program to recruit and support volunteers and build partnerships. The Native Hawaiian Cultural Working Group (CWG) continues to assist the Monument with permit application review and developing nomenclature. The CWG convened in May in Hilo to assist with the Native Hawaiian Plan. A 10-part video series, "Voices of Papahānaumokuākea" is being produced by OHA and ONMS. The series is co-funded by NOAA.

7. Update on enforcement activities NOAA OLE (Jim On): Mr. Jim On shared with the Council that in November 2017 a longline vessel was detected operating 5-6 miles inside the Monument. Chart logs were old and incorrect. The operator was levied a fine of \$17,000. A final fine for

about \$16,000 was assessed. NOAA OLE was able to determine the segment of catch that was extracted from Monument and the fine was based on that percentage and its value. The Council inquired about if cultural considerations can be included in the analysis of damages.

More discussion with NOAA OLE is included later in the agenda.

8. Update on enforcement activities USCG (Roberts): Mr. Roberts provided the RAC with an update on enforcement activities. Highlights include: patrol boat CGC Alex Haley D14 conducted patrol, including helicopter surveillance, in July 2018. Radar satellite imagery was collected (see slide) and includes overlapping segments in the Monument. No vessels were detected. ) Short-range drone testing has been initiated for the purposes of search and rescue and marine environmental response (e.g. oil spills). The USCG is not testing platforms appropriate for PMNM yet. Roberts has requested operations in the HIHWNMS as a test program for Hawai'i. The presentation from USCG is available on the PMNM/RAC website.

More discussion with USCG is included later in the agenda.

#### V. PUBLIC COMMENT

No public comment.

#### VI. PRESENTATION AND UPDATES

1. 2017 Permitted Activities Report (Borges): NOAA-ONMS Permit Specialist presented to the Council on the 2017 permitted activities in the Monument. In 2017, 31 permit applications were received and 20 permits were issued. All permit applications must complete a rigorous process of environmental and cultural review and documentation of meeting the applicable permitting criteria, which include the Findings in Proclamation 8031. The full presentation is available on the PMNM/RAC website.

2. Capitol Hill Oceans Week Report (Aila Jr/Clark/ Gaffney/Kaho'ohalahala): RAC members William Aila Jr., Rick Gaffney, and Sol Kaho'ohalahala, and ONMS-PMNM Superintendent Athline Clark attended Capitol Hill Oceans Week (CHOW) in June 2018. Highlights from CHOW included: Kaho'ohalahala performed the opening protocol at the CHOW gala; meetings with NOAA-ONMS, NOAA-NMFS, and various congressional and senatorial offices stressing the importance of the connectivity of all ocean resources; a meeting with Senators Schatz and Hirono and their staff; and a meeting with Dave Chun, Chief Legislative Aide in Representative Tulsi Gabbard's office. The Coral Reef Conservation Act is up for reauthorization and the Coral Reef Task Force is meeting in American Samoa in August 2018.

#### VII. POTENTIAL ACTIONS

1. Potential RAC Action, surveillance in the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands: The Council discussed writing a letter to the USCG and NOAA-OLE addressing surveillance in the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands. Recreational Fishing Representative Rick Gaffney presented a list of potential technologies that could be used for surveillance. Gaffney proposed linking law enforcement and scientific research in the Monument. The Council will develop a list of management driven needs that could be obtained by the use of advanced technologies. There is interest in having a workshop with the RAC, NOAA-OLE, USCG, and technology companies focused on surveillance and other management needs. The companies would need to explain

their technologies, how the technologies would meet the needs of the Monument, and how sustainable the technologies would be with the remoteness of the Monument.

The Research Subcommittee will continue working on this topic.

**NOAA-OLE Action:** The Council requested a presentation at the October 11 RAC on capabilities for vessel monitoring systems.

**NOAA-ONMS Action:** The Council requested any information ONMS had previously compiled on the use of unmanned aircraft systems in the Monument.

#### VIII. RAC WORK PLANS

The Council discussed the Council Administration and Operations work plan. The Research Subcommittee and Education and Outreach Working Group met to establish purposes and develop their 3-year work plans. The two groups reported briefly on progress at the end of the session. The draft purposes for the groups are:

Research Subcommittee (Harp, Schug, Aila Jr., Kenyon, Thompson, Gaffney, Carnevale) – Provide support and recommendations to the ONMS PMNM on scientific, cultural, and historic research.

Education and Outreach Working Group (Grabowsky (Chair), Kane, Holm, Paul, Wooley, Kaho‘ohalahala) – enable effective communication and collaboration to implement/mobilize the monument management plan.

The Work Plan draft is posted on the PMNM/RAC website.

#### IX. PUBLIC COMMENT

No comments. Self-introduction by social science researcher Leslie Acton, who is conducting an independent study of PMNM governance.

#### X. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 3:30 p.m.